

Case Study Analysis of Unified and Non-Unified Planning of Urban Public Space

Diya Yang^{1,a,*}

*School of Architecture and Urban Planning, Huazhong University of Science and Technology,
Wuhan, Hubei, China, 430074*

a. Dwjbydy48@163.com

**corresponding author*

Abstract: This paper briefly reviews the development history of urban public space management, organizes the public space management tools and methods that accompany urban development, focuses on the analysis of domestic and foreign public space planning cases with different degrees of uniformity, analyzes the problems embedded in urban public space under different plans in the context of relevant design concepts of urban planning, and explores the possibility of disorder-oriented urban planning tools and the balance between uniformity and non-uniformity on the premise of the necessity of uniform planning. The study will explore the possibility of design-oriented urban planning tools and the balance between uniformity and non-uniformity. This paper finds that unified planning is necessary for the planning of urban public spaces, but more attention should be paid to disorderliness in design to avoid disadvantages.

Keywords: urban planning, public space, terrain vague, management, disorder

1. Introduction

Urban public space is a coherent process from planning to management. As a public good, public space has become an important part of the work of municipalities. The study of its planning and management can help solve the present situation of uniform and monotonous urban public space, effectively improve the quality of life of urban residents, and enable the public to share public space in a harmonious and fair way; it is very important to improve the sustainability of urban public space development.

This paper adopts a case study approach to review the current situation of urban public space in modern cities, which is mostly planned by the government or related agencies, and compares cases of urban public space under different degrees of unified planning, and discusses its necessity to open up new ideas of public space planning. The significance of this study is that the research and practice of urban public space management in China is still at the stage of exploration and development, so an in-depth study of this topic can further clarify the connotation system of urban public space and its management.

2. Management of Urban Public Space

Regarding the concept of urban public space, the American scholar Oscar Newman has expressed in his research that urban public space is a public place for people's leisure, entertainment, and sports[1]. places that mediate between private spaces and are used for a variety of often overlapping functions and for certain symbolic purposes. In terms of norms, these spaces are considered public if they are provided and managed by public institutions and involve all citizens, are open to them, and are shared or used by all members of the community. In the United States, public space is divided into public forums, limited public forums, and non-public forums according to the degree of openness of the public space[1]. The most open public spaces, the typical public forums, include places such as streets and parks, which are "immediately entrusted to public use," and the most open public spaces have been used for the purpose of assemblies, the exchange of ideas among citizens, and the discussion of public issues". They must be and remain open, accessible to all, and limited in their expressive activities only in very narrow circumstances. The least open public spaces are non-public forums, including "public property that is not traditionally or explicitly a forum for public exchange," and who may use these public spaces and how they are used is limited to specific organizational groups and activities. Between the two extremes, the U.S. Supreme Court has also defined a third category: limited public forums. Unlike parks and streets, they are not traditionally open but are "places that the state has opened to the public for expressive activity.

2.1. Survival of Marginalized People

Terrain vague means landscapes that can be considered unproductive or valueless and engender only indeterminant activity or no activity at all have indeterminant ownership or appear to belong to no one[2].

Developers and city officials look at terrain vague as potential geography to be reincorporated within the productive logic of the city by transforming them.

Such terrain vague are also places for marginalized people in the city, yet due to urban development, a large number of terrain vague have been developed into sophisticated urban public areas and tangible or invisible thresholds have been set up for homeless people who once belonged here.

2.2. Managed Public Space

Although the free people of the city-state states enjoyed extensive powers of participation in public affairs in ancient Greece, it is only in the centuries that the concept of the public has really been studied. Political philosopher Hannah Arendt sees public space as a republican or civic virtue[3]. She argues that the public sphere implies public space, and that the term public means, first and foremost, that whatever appears in public is able to be seen and heard by everyone and has a broad public character.

However, the management of public space is not always widely public, and given the complexity of management, completely free management may be difficult for the government to adopt at this time.

2.2.1. Management Methods

In China, there are currently three main approaches to urban public space management.

First of all, the government-led approach is the most common management approach in the state of centralized management power, i.e., the government's single type of management. This approach is the most common way of urban management since its inception. It is the most direct and effective

way of urban public space management, which is based on a hierarchical structure with corresponding management departments and staff assigned by the departments for field management, which is convenient for giving tasks and overall control.

The government-enterprise cooperation model means that the government and the outsourcing enterprise sign a cooperation agreement to outsource the service management to the enterprise, and the government is responsible for supervision and inspection work. This management method can reduce the work pressure on the management department by introducing market competition and incentive mechanisms to promote the efficiency and quality of the management fee, combined with the characteristics of a long time, large scope and intensity of the earthly public space management. However, the imperfect supervision system in the public-private partnership may still lead to the abuse of authority. Finally, pluralistic participation in the management of urban public space is a development trend in recent years. This approach introduces the participation of subjects such as social organizations and the public in addition to the government and enterprises, which enhances the city's governance capacity from different perspectives. This management mode can not only mobilize the enthusiasm of each elemental subject in the city for the management of public space but also can form a spontaneous supervisory force, which shows that adopting the management method of multiple subjects should be the ideal way for the management of urban public space.

2.2.2. Management Tools

In terms of the means of management, there are two main means of human inspection and the use of modern technology.

In the management process of urban public space, the most common means of traditional management is to complete field inspections, find problems and solve them by recruiting staff of relevant professions. Due to the large scope of urban public space management, complex objects and uncertainties, other off-site management or law enforcement tend to show shortcomings, so the majority of cases management type work still can not leave the manual. However, because the management process of public space will have more direct contact with citizens, increasing the workload and complexity, the implementation of a single human inspection will affect the management effect, and the disadvantages of managers and the managed are often exposed, so such management means are contrary to the development trend of modern management.

The use of wisdom tools is emphasized in the modern approach to urban governance. In recent years, governments have been introducing smart management technologies and establishing various management information systems to make the government work more efficiently. The use of technology-based management tools to reduce repetitive and simple human work, such as the health code and trip code system launched vigorously in China in the epidemic era to collect the trip and nucleic acid status of personnel has built a China-specific online and offline linkage of regular management. However, in case of emergency, some system and network technical problems may lead to lag and system breakdown, then the time-consuming repair work may cause dissatisfaction with the management. And in some cases where flexibility is needed, the rigidity of the procedure may intensify the conflict and prevent the problem from being solved in an optimal way.

3. Research on Non-uniform Planning of Urban Public Space - Taking Millennium Park as An Example

Non-uniform planning can be considered as a different model of planning than uniform urban planning by the government, which can be under the control of multiple authorities, as in the case of Millennium Park, or under the full control of the citizens.

Millennium Park is a civic recreation park that combines public art, architecture, recreational activities, and natural ecology, and is a perfect blend of public and artistic, representing the vitality and energy of the city of Chicago.

3.1. Consistency of Design Style and Function of Modern Public Space

Formerly a parking lot and a railroad track that ran through the area, Millennium Park was redeveloped in 1998[4]. A number of renowned architects and artists were invited to participate in the project, and this was a key factor in the success of Millennium Park.

The architectural theme is in keeping with Gehry's bold style, with the roof resembling a giant golden flower, the 7,000-seat lawn topped by a mesh dome of alternating steel, and a sound system that allows the music to be felt even from the farthest reaches of the stage. The entire open-air concert hall creates a strong visual impact, contrasting with the "square box" modern architecture surrounding Millennium Park.

Cloud gate by the British artist Anish Kapoor. The sculpture is the most popular artwork in Millennium Park, made of polished stainless steel, the surface reflects the Chicago landscape, and almost every citizen and tourist passing by this place will stop to look at it and take a picture, people unknowingly become part of this work, staged The encounter between people and art, people and people.

The Crown Fountain is also one of the most popular sculptures in Millennium Park. It incorporates digital media technology and features two square-shaped bodies placed in opposition to each other, with a giant display on the façade that alternates every hour with a close-up of a citizen's facial expression, creating a light-hearted and humorous atmosphere.

3.2. Private Interest Control

Even though the public artwork in Millennium Park has been recognized by the public, the reality behind it cannot be denied. While the City of Chicago is responsible for half of the park's budget, Millennium Park is sponsored by a number of private institutions. McDonald's Cycle Center, for example, was originally an indoor bicycle station that provided a variety of services to bicyclists but was renamed after receiving sponsorship from McDonald's and other organizations[5]. As the name of a very important public facility in the city, McDonald's undoubtedly occupies a prominent "billboard", and associating a sports-related field with fast food will undoubtedly have a positive effect on the image of the company. The same happened with the Crown fountain, which was named Crown fountain because of its sponsor, the Crown family, a large family that owns many well-known properties and groups.

Such private interests not only defined Millennium Park but also screened the artwork in the park, including the incongruity of the artwork that has been criticized by the public, reflecting the interests and aesthetics of the private sponsors. This has shaped the unqualified success of Millennium Park, which is popular with visitors but controlled by private interests, making it ultimately nothing more than a showcase for the interests and preferences of those with private interests.

4. How to Do Urban Public Space Planning -- Taking the Knowledge & Innovation Community Garden in Shanghai as An Example

The Knowledge & Innovation Community Garden is a 24-hour accessible garden converted from a landfill and is the first hub garden located in an open neighborhood in Shanghai[6].

The overall layout of The Knowledge & Innovation Community Garden is divided into a facility service area, public activity area, a farming area, a one-meter vegetable garden area and an interactive gardening area. The indoor area and public area transformed by containers are located in the middle

of the farm garden, with large public farming areas on both sides, among which the northern farming area has a pathway and rest seats through the north and south. Sustainable energy recycling facilities such as waste separation bins, vermicomposting towers, various composting facilities, rainwater collection, and small greenhouses are located throughout the garden.

There is a dedicated team that conducts classes on gardening for interested residents in the community. The 'Young Community Planners' is designed to encourage children and teenagers to have a deeper understanding of their own communities, with the goal to propose solutions for all those problems they find during the investigation. This process also allows them to pay attention to the residents who need help, such as the seniors living alone, and thus to think about how to create better-living conditions for these groups.

Its design team has introduced the concept of a "community garden", which is not just mere planning or landscape design but can be considered a complete social governance system that intends to involve the public directly in the production of space and urban renewal.

The Knowledge & Innovation Community Garden, along with its fellow community gardens, encourages a free-form self-empowerment beyond the public services provided by the market and the government, and allows for the self-production and self-growth of public spaces, creating a 'cooperative landscape'. Unlike the uniformly planned landscape spaces in other cities, in the Knowledge & Innovation Community Garden, everyone can feel the subjectivity of their own participation and the energy they exude.

4.1. Disorderly Design

In the wave of urban renewal, decision-makers often prefer a defined, predictable and balanced form, which often implies stability, order, and "closure", making it easier for decision-makers to manage. Political thinker Benjamin Constant proposes an ideal society in which people not only learn to live with ambiguity, conflict and complexity but also benefit from it[7].

When planning, designers tend to differentiate spaces functionally through formulaic patterns: residential, school, shopping, etc., so that different areas are predetermined for different uses and users. However, the more cities are categorized into different zones, the more obvious an invisible "master-servant" relationship becomes: the norms and plans that designate the explicit use of individual spaces become the "masters", while humans remain the "servants". The "servants" are the individuals who are subordinated to the rules of these spaces, and who only use them according to their inherent design uses. In the book *Designing Disorder: Experiments and disruptions in the city*, author Pablo Sendra refers to three forms of open cities: Passage Territories, Incomplete Objects, and Nonlinear Narratives. Nonlinear Narratives, which are also seen as an important part of disorder design.

4.2. Passage Territories

Passage territories contain two parts, one is the wall, the wall in the city should be both permeable and defensive, so that the division between inside and outside is resilient and the building becomes part of the extension of the city.

The second is the border, which is the junction where different groups interact. In nature, the border is often the most mundane and active area for interchangeable activities. If designers want to give life to an area, they usually try to emphasize the central location and ignore the periphery. Under such a planning approach, communication gradually decreases while control becomes stricter, and the boundary is reduced to a product of maintaining order.

The public design of cities should be mindful of walls and boundaries, as places of communication and defense, there will also be situations where conflict and contradiction occur, but these instabilities

should be seen as part of the collective life, with the unexpected actions that arise from limited control, in order to make people aware that they are stepping from one sphere into another.

4.3. Incomplete Objects

Incomplete objects should be designed in a special way, this kind of incomplete design reserves space for users to make alterations according to their needs, in the process of alteration, space and users will also create a kind of conflict, but as this interaction goes on, the whole space can get positive growth.

4.4. Nonlinear Narratives

Designers often have a fixed mindset when planning cities: assume that the plan will evolve chronologically, leaving no room for realistic corrections. A non-linear narrative allows designers to focus on the various stages of a given plan. Rather than pursuing a single goal, it is more important to focus on the possibilities for differences and conflicts that are facilitated by the various stages of the design process and to ensure that these possibilities are not stifled, allowing conflicting elements to act naturally and allowing the overall design framework to be more open.

5. Conclusion

This paper discusses the use of non-uniform planning in urban public spaces. The planning of urban public space is a complex process. In the process of planning, planners should allow differences and conflicts to exist, and regard public space as a vital existence, so that it can grow in balance and imbalance. An overly ordered and highly uniform planning will inevitably make public space lose its vitality and gradually become closed and rigid. In an environment, only the interaction of different functional organisms can give this environment diverse energy. Due to some domestic and international policy differences, there may be some data in this thesis that are not up to date. It is hoped that future research in this area will focus more on the specific measures and implementation of non-uniformity planning, and open up new paths for urban public space management.

References

- [1] Guo Lu, *Urban Public Spaces Management from the Perspective of Comprehensive Urban[D]*. Southwest Jiaotong University, 2020:15. *Research*, 2020, (23):84-85.
- [2] Dora Epstein Jones, *TERRAIN VAGUE: THE SPACE OF THE POSSIBLE*. <https://architecture.academyart.edu/portfolio-item/terrain-vague/>
- [3] Yixia Wu. *Doing with whom [D]*. Central Academy of Fine Arts, 2012:16-17
- [4] Shi Yulin, Cao Lei. *A Study of Art-Oriented Urban Renewal Strategies: The Case of Chicago's Millennium Park [J]*. Fine Arts Education
- [5] Ken Lum, *Some Reflections on Urban Public Art Today*. 2014. <https://penniur.upenn.edu/publications/some-reflections-on-urban-public-art-today>
- [6] <https://www.goood.cn/rumble-community-garden-liu-yuelai.htm>
- [7] Pablo Sendra, Richard Sennett. *Designing Disorder: Experiments and Disruptions in the City*. 2021:12-13